# **Policy and Sustainability Committee**

# 10:00am, Tuesday, 24 October 2023

# Pay gap report 2023

Executive/routine Wards

#### Recommendations

- 1.1 The Policy and Sustainability Committee is recommended to review and note the content of the 2023 update on organisation gender, ethnicity and disability pay gaps, including the new suite of reporting for pay gap intersectionality.
- 1.2 It should be noted the 2023 reporting contains new insight not previously published in the public domain.
- 1.3 This report should be read in conjunction with our EDI strategy update (Equalities, Diversity, and Inclusion) which includes a review of the activities ongoing to reduce pay gaps across the organisation.
- 1.4 This report should also be read in conjunction with our updated policy statement on Equal Pay.

#### **Deborah Smart**

**Executive Director of Corporate Services** 

Contact: Nareen Turnbull, Service Director, Human Resources

E-mail: Nareen.turnbull@edinburgh.gov.uk | Tel: 0131 469 5522

# Report

# Pay gap report 2023

# **Executive Summary**

- 2.1 The Council is bound by duties arising from the Equality Act 2010 (Specific Duties) (Scotland) Regulations 2012 to publish gender pay gap information every two years. This report fulfils our statutory requirement for reporting the gender pay gap in 2023.
- 2.2 This report also meets our commitment to report ethnicity and disability pay gaps on an annual basis.
- 2.3 In addition, this report meets the commitment made to Elected Members last Autumn to provide further analysis of pay gap intersectionality.
- 2.4 The insight in this report is based on HR and Payroll system data extracted on 31 March 2023.
- 2.5 Further information on the component parts of pay gap reporting is contained in **Appendix one**.
- 2.6 Key points to note from the 2023 report are (mean average pay gaps):
  - The gender pay gap reduced to 2.4% (from 3.2%)
  - The ethnicity pay gap, excluding white minority populations, increased to 16.2% (from 15.2%)
  - The ethnicity pay gap, including white minority populations, is 11.4% (new reporting for 2023)
  - The disability pay gap increased to 8.7% (from 5.0%)
- 2.7 Changes since last year's report should be considered in the context of changes to disclosure rates, workforce profile, the scope of contracts and payments included in the analysis, and methodology.
- 2.8 We recognise that:
  - In general, our workforce profile is not adequately reflected at senior levels of the organisation.
  - Women, minority ethnic colleagues, and disabled colleagues, are often concentrated in part-time roles; and part-time working tends to be concentrated in lower paid roles.

There is a lack of availability of part-time working opportunities at more senior levels of the organisation.

- 2.9 Longer-term, we want to focus on implementing strategic actions to improve our position in respect of:
  - Representation in leadership roles and positions of influence
  - Availability of part-time roles at the senior level

# Background

- 3.1 By examining the extent of pay gaps and understanding their underlying causes, we can identify areas for improvement and develop strategies and targeted initiatives to reduce pay gaps and address potential systemic bias or barriers that can occur and prevent pay equality.
- 3.2 In 2023, our reporting examines pay gap intersectionality to better understand the unique challenges faced by employees from diverse backgrounds.
- 3.3 This year's analysis includes updates to the scope of workforce groups and payments and establishes a refreshed baseline for pay gap reporting moving forward. We now include the casual and supply workforce and Allowances. It should be noted that casual and supply workers are engaged under different terms to those employed on a permanent or fixed-term basis. The scope of analysis is detailed in **Appendix two**.
- 3.4 We have reviewed and corrected a methodological discrepancy for the calculation of average pay values for the Learning and Teaching population, for improved robustness of outputs.
- 3.5 We have reviewed and improved our approach to ethnicity pay gap reporting in response to UK Government guidance published in April 2023.
- 3.6 We continue working to improve the quantity and quality of employee data held for protected characteristics and monitor changes to the workforce profile (see **Appendix three**). The workforce profile remained relatively unchanged over the last twelve months however there were some points of note:
  - The minority ethnic workforce increased by 281 colleagues and the workforce profile increased from 4% to 5% – the increase was predominantly concentrated in LGE grades one to four and the L&T main teacher grade.
  - The declared disabled workforce increased by 128 colleagues the increase
    was predominantly concentrated in LGE grades one to four, and we also saw a
    small reduction in the number of declared disabled employees in senior LGE
    grades.
- 3.7 A review of the effectiveness of the Public Sector Equality (PSED) in Scotland is currently underway. As part of the phased change programme, Regulation seven will be revised from 1 April 2025. From this date, public bodies will be required to

report on ethnicity and disability pay gaps, in addition to reporting their gender pay gap.

# Main report

4.1 Detailed reporting of the gender, ethnicity, disability, and intersectionality pay gaps is available in the appendices of this report. The detailed reports provide the component parts of pay gap reporting required from a statutory perspective, including analysis of hourly rates, mean and median pay gaps, bonus analysis, and quartile analysis. In addition, the reports look at vertical and horizontal segregation of the workforce and explore the drivers of pay gaps and changes observed since 2022.

#### Gender pay gap 2023

- 4.2 Gender pay gap analysis compares the pay of women to that of men.
- 4.3 The mean gender pay gap reduced to 2.4% (from 3.2% in 2022). This means for every £1 earned by a man, a woman earns 98p.
- 4.4 The median gender pay gap reduced to 4.3% (from 6.9% in 2022). This means for every £1 earned by a man, a woman earns 96p.
- 4.5 **Appendix four** provides detailed analysis of the gender pay gap.

#### Ethnicity pay gap 2023 (i) -

#### Pay gap between minority ethnic colleagues and white colleagues

- 4.6 This ethnicity pay gap analysis compares the pay of minority ethnic colleagues (excluding white minorities) with that of white colleagues.
- 4.7 The mean pay gap for the minority ethnic group increased to 16.2% (from 15.2% in 2022). This means that for every £1 a white colleague earns, a minority ethnic colleague earns 84p.
- 4.8 The median pay gap for this group increased to 20.4% (from 15.9% in 2022). This means that for every £1 a white colleague earns, a colleague from the minority ethnic group earns 80p.

#### Ethnicity pay gap 2023 (ii) -

#### Pay gap between minority ethnic colleagues and white British colleagues

4.9 This ethnicity pay gap analysis compares the pay of minority ethnic colleagues (including white minorities and white non-British nationalities) with that of white British colleagues.

- 4.10 When including white minority populations with an ethnic background, the mean ethnicity pay gap is lower, at 11.4%. This means that for every £1 a white British colleague earns, a minority ethnic colleague earns 89p.
- 4.11 When including white minority populations with an ethnic background, the median ethnicity pay gap is also lower, at 16.2%. This means that for every £1 a white British colleague earns, a minority ethnic colleague earns 84p.
- 4.12 **Appendix five** provides detailed analysis of the ethnicity pay gap and explanation as to why the pay gap has increased since last year.

#### Disability pay gap 2023

- 4.12 The disability pay gap compares the pay gap between employees who identify as having a disability or long-term health condition (declared disabled), and those employees who do not (not disabled).
- 4.13 The mean average pay gap for declared disabled employees increased to 8.7% (from 5.0% in 2022). This means that for every £1 earned by an employee who is not disabled, a declared disabled employee earns 91p.
- 4.14 The median average pay gap for declared disabled employees increased to 7.6% (from 5.0% in 2022). This means that for every £1 earned by an employee who is not disabled, a declared disabled employee earns 92p.
- 4.15 **Appendix six** provides detailed analysis of the disability pay gap and explanation as to why the pay gap has increased since last year.

#### Intersectionality pay gap analysis 2023

- 4.16 Pay gap intersectionality refers to the overlapping effects and compounded disadvantages experienced by individuals who belong to multiple marginalised groups, resulting in even greater disparities in pay and earnings. It recognises that individuals face unique challenges and discrimination based on the intersection of their gender, race, ethnicity, disability, and other social identities.
- 4.17 We recognise that some pay gaps are larger than we'd like, and we've undertaken a range of scenario modelling to understand what it would take to close these gaps.
- 4.18 Highlights from the intersectionality pay gap analysis 2023 are (mean pay gaps reported):
  - The pay gap between minority ethnic women (excluding white minorities) and white men is 18.9%;
  - The pay gap between minority ethnic women (including white minorities) and white British men is 14.4%;
  - The pay gap between declared disabled women and men who are not disabled is 10.4%:
  - The pay gap between part-time women and full-time men is 15.9%;
  - The pay gap between part-time minority ethnic women (excluding white minorities) and full-time white men is 29.3%;

- The pay gap between part-time minority ethnic women (including white minorities) and full-time white British men is 26.3%;
- The pay gap between part-time declared disabled women and full-time men who are not disabled is 23.7%.
- 4.19 **Appendix seven** provides detailed analysis of intersectionality pay gaps and this analysis has helped us to identify priority areas to target moving forward. More information is included in **Appendix ten:** What are we doing to close the pay gaps?
- 4.20 Pay gap benchmarking data is available in **Appendix eight**.
- 4.21 Pay gap trend data for the period 2018 to 2023 is available in **Appendix nine**. Note that we began reporting the pay gaps for ethnicity and disability from 2021.

### **Next Steps**

- 5.1 We will continue to progress the activities identified in the EDI strategy and action plan.
- 5.2 We will refresh our People Strategy and Action Plan and will use evidence from pay gap analysis where relevant to inform the development of strategic actions.
- 5.2 We will provide the next pay gap update to Committee in October 2024.

# **Financial impact**

6.1 None.

# **Equality and Poverty Impact**

- 7.1 The Council is bound by duties arising from the Equality Act 2010 (Specific Duties) (Scotland) Regulations 2012 to publish. This report fulfils the public sector equality duty to publish gender pay gap information as laid out in the Equality Act 2010 (Specific Duties) (Scotland) Regulations 2012, Regulation 7.
- 7.3 An update on EDI actions over the last year is also being reported at the Policy and Sustainability Committee in October 2023 and should be read in conjunction with this pay gap report.
- 7.3 Insight from this report was used to establish an evidence base in developing elements of our longer-term EDI strategy, and priority actions. The updated strategy will be published in 2024.

# **Climate and Nature Emergency Implications**

8.1 None.

# Risk, policy, compliance, governance and community impact

- 9.1 In developing this report we have engaged with and reviewed best practice of external organisations and groups, including other Scottish local authorities, UK Government, Society of Personnel Development Scotland (SPDS), Close the Gap, Equalities and Human Rights Commission (EHRC).
- 9.2 The information contained in this report fulfils our statutory obligation around gender pay gap reporting and local commitments in respect of ethnicity, disability and intersectionality pay gap reporting.
- 9.3 Whilst there are no specific risks arising from this pay gap report it should be noted that the new insight relating to intersectionality analysis will be published in the public domain for the first time this year.
- 9.4 The EDI strategy and action plan contains recommendations for strategic approaches to reduce pay gaps and documents the associated risks.

# **Background reading/external references**

- Pay gap report 2022, Policy and Sustainability Committee, 1 November 2022: <a href="https://democracy.edinburgh.gov.uk/documents/s50210/7.2%20Pay%20Gap%20Update%202022.pdf">https://democracy.edinburgh.gov.uk/documents/s50210/7.2%20Pay%20Gap%20Update%202022.pdf</a>
- EDI strategy and action plan, Policy and Sustainability Committee, 24 October 2023.
- Equality and diversity framework 2021 to 2025: https://www.edinburgh.gov.uk/documents/equality-diversity-framework-2021-2025
- Close the Gap:
  - https://www.closethegap.org.uk/content/gap/
  - https://www.closethegap.org.uk/content/resources/Close-the-Gap-Response-to-Consultation-on-Increasing-Employment-of-Disabled-People.pdf
- UK guidance gender pay gap analysis: <a href="https://www.gov.uk/government/publications/gender-pay-gap-reporting-guidance-for-employers">https://www.gov.uk/government/publications/gender-pay-gap-reporting-guidance-for-employers</a>
- UK guidance ethnicity pay gap analysis: <a href="https://www.gov.uk/government/publications/ethnicity-pay-reporting-guidance-for-employers">https://www.gov.uk/government/publications/ethnicity-pay-reporting-guidance-for-employers</a>

# **Appendices**

Appendix one: Component parts of pay gap reporting

Appendix two: Scope of pay gap analysis

Appendix three: Workforce profile

Appendix four: Gender Pay Gap report 2023

Appendix five: Ethnicity Pay Gap report 2023

Appendix six: Disability Pay Gap report 2023

Appendix seven: Intersectionality pay gap analysis

Appendix eight: Intersectionality analysis – average hourly pay data

Appendix nine: Benchmarking data

Appendix ten: What are we doing to close the pay gaps?

Appendix eleven: Pay gap trends 2018 to 2023

# Appendix one: Component parts of pay gap reporting

#### Pay gap analysis

A "pay gap" is not the same as "equal pay". Equal pay is the equal payment of groups with different characteristics for undertaking the same work or equivalent jobs across the organisation. See our updated policy statement on Equal Pay that accompanies this report for further information on our commitment to equal pay.

Pay gap analysis shows the difference in average hourly rate between one group and another, for example women and men (the gender pay gap), minority ethnic and white or white British colleagues (the ethnicity pay gap) and declared disabled colleagues and colleagues who are not disabled (the disability pay gap).

Pay gap analysis is expressed as a percentage. A pay gap is calculated by working out the difference between the average hourly rate between one group and another. Pay gap analysis captures the mean average and median average hourly rates and resulting pay gaps.

Mean average hourly rate: The mean of a group of values is the sum of all values added together and divided by the number of values in the set.

Mean pay gap: The mean pay gap is a measure of the difference between one group's mean hourly wage and another group's mean hourly wage.

Median average hourly rate: The median of a group of values is calculated by ranking all values in order, from the highest to the lowest, and taking the value in the middle.

Median pay gap: The median pay gap is the difference between one group's median hourly wage and another group's median hourly wage.

#### **Quartile analysis**

A pay quartile represents a quarter, or 25%, of the workforce, ranked by pay. The pay quartiles are then broken down by protected characteristic. This is then compared in relation to the overall workforce profile.

#### **Vertical segregation**

Vertical segregation denotes the situation whereby opportunities for career progression for a particular protected characteristic are limited. Our data for vertical segregation looks at populations in the salary bandings of less than £20K, £20K to £29,999, £30K to £39,999, £40K to £49,999, £50K to £59,999, £60K to £69,999, £70K to £79,999, more than £80K.

#### **Horizontal segregation**

Horizontal (occupational) segregation occurs when one demographic group is overrepresented or under-represented among different kinds of work or different types of jobs. Our data for horizontal segregation looks at populations in the following groups.

Business Support – example roles include Business Support Administrator, Transactions Administrator

Care – example roles include Social Care Worker, Social Care Assistant, Residential Care Officer

Catering, cleaning, and facilities management (FM) – example roles include Cleaning Operative, Cook, Facilities Technician

Frontline Public Services – example roles include Waste and Cleansing Operative

Leadership – example roles include Service Director, Head of Service, Service Manager, Head Teacher

Manager – example roles include Business Manager, Team Leader

Professional and Technical – example roles include Engineer, Housing Officer, Policy Adviser

School Support – example roles include Pupil Support Assistant, Early Years Practitioner, Early Years Officer

Teacher - example roles include School Teachers

# Appendix two: Scope of pay gap analysis

Pay gap reporting includes analysis of all Council employees and workers on the following pay and grading structures.

- 1. Local Government Employees (LGE): Grades one to twelve, using national SJC pay structure, underpinned by Capital job evaluation scheme.
- 2. Learning and Teaching (L&T): Scottish Negotiating Committee for Teachers (SNCT) national grades/salaries, jobs sized in accordance with SNCT approach.
- 3. Chief Officers: Nationally agreed grading structure underpinned by Korn Ferry job evaluation scheme.

The scope of the organisation's pay gap analysis is as follows:

- Employee groups in scope: Local Government Employees, Learning and Teaching and Chief Officers
- Employee groups excluded: Agency
- Contracts in scope: Permanent, fixed term, temporary, apprentice, trainee, casual and supply
- Payments in scope: Basic pay, working time payments, allowances, contractual overtime
- Payments excluded: Salary sacrifice, claims-based overtime

This year's reporting reflects a total of 21,648 contracts in place at 31 March 2023, with a headcount of 19,627.

# **Appendix three: Workforce profile**

#### Workforce profile - sex

Representation of women at the Council was broadly unchanged since last year. The 2023 report is based on 100% disclosure for sex.

2023: Female 71%, male 29%

2022: Female 70%, male 30%

#### Workforce profile - ethnicity

The representation of minority ethnic groups increased by 1% over the last twelve months.

The 2023 report is based on 80% disclosure for "ethnic group" (excluding white minority groups) and 74% disclosure for "ethnic background" (including white minority groups). The two disclosure rates differ as some colleagues have only disclosed partial information.

We have followed the new <u>UK guidance</u> in relation to the ethnicity pay gap and the scope of groups analysed.

#### <u>Disclosure – minority ethnic workforce (i) (excluding white minorities)</u>

2023: Minority ethnic (excluding white minorities) 5%, white 75%, prefer not to say 3%, no information 16%

2022: Minority ethnic (excluding white minorities) 4%, white 77%, prefer not to say 3%, no information 16%

#### In the above:

- The minority ethnic group includes African groups, Asian groups, Caribbean or Black groups, mixed or multiple ethnic groups and other ethnic groups.
- The white group includes white colleagues of any ethnic background\* or nationality.

<u>Disclosure – minority ethnic workforce (ii) (including white minorities) (new data for 2023)</u>

2023: Minority ethnic (including white minorities) 9%, white British 65%, prefer not to say 4%, no information 23%

#### In the above:

- The minority ethnic group includes any colleagues who have not identified as being white British.
- The white British group includes any colleagues who have identified as such.

#### Workforce profile - disability

The percentage representation of declared disabled colleagues was broadly unchanged since last year however we did see an increase of 128 colleagues in this group over the twelve months. The 2023 report is based on 77% disclosure for disability.

Policy and Sustainability Committee - 24 October 2023

<sup>\*</sup>Examples include white Gypsy/Traveller, showman or showwoman and Roma.

2023: Declared disabled 3%, not disabled 74%, prefer not to say 5%, no information 18%. Of those declared disabled 45% are limited a little, 55% are limited a lot.

2022: Declared disabled 3%, not disabled 76%, prefer not to say 5%, no information 17%. Of those declared disabled 35% are limited a little, 65% are limited a lot.

#### Workforce profile – part-time working

Representation of part-time colleagues was unchanged since last year. The 2023 report is based on 100% data completeness for contractual basis.

2023: Part-time workforce 52%, full-time workforce 48%. Part-time women 82%, part-time men 18%. Note figures are impacted by change to scope of workforce analysis in 2023 to include casual and supply contracts which are categorised as part-time for the purposes of analysis.

2022: Part-time workforce 42%, full-time workforce 58%. Part-time women 85%, part-time men 15%.

Figure 1: Lo	Figure 1: LGE part-time workforce by grade			
Grade 1:	Part-time 92.5%,	Full-time 7.5%		
Grade 2:	Part-time 97.1%,	Full-time 2.9%		
Grade 3:	Part-time 80.3%,	Full-time 19.7%		
Grade 4:	Part-time 40.6%,	Full-time 59.4%		
Grade 5:	Part-time 42%,	Full-time 58%		
Grade 6:	Part-time 26.1%,	Full-time 73.9%		
Grade 7:	Part-time 27.7%,	Full-time 72.3%		
Grade 8:	Part-time 23.8%,	Full-time 76.2%		
Grade 9:	Part-time 15.3%,	Full-time 84.7%		
Grade 10:	Part-time 4.5%,	Full-time 95.5%		
Grade 11:	Part-time 5.1%,	Full-time 94.9%		
Grade 12:	Part-time 0%,	Full-time 100%		

#### Workforce profile - age

The age profile of the organisation was broadly unchanged since last year.

Under 21 years: Workforce 1%

21 to 29 years: Workforce 12%

30 to 39 years: Workforce 22%

40 to 49 years: Workforce 25%

50 to 59 years: Workforce 26%

60 to 64 years: Workforce 10%

Over 65 years: Workforce 4%

Figure 3: Workforce population in over forty and under forty years age bandings

Under forty years of age: Workforce 36%. Female 72%, male 28%.

Over forty years of age: Workforce 64%. Female 70%, male 30%.

# Appendix four: Gender pay gap report 2023

#### **Background**

Gender pay gap analysis compares the pay of women to that of men. Women, on average, continue to earn less than their male counterparts for comparable work across various professions and sectors.

Following current requirements for gender pay gap reporting, gender must be reported in a binary way, recognising only men and women, and we are unable to report non-binary or other identities in this report. We recognise that gender is not a binary concept, and we support non-binary, and intersex colleagues alongside those who identify as male or female.

The gender pay gap is driven by a combination of complex factors that interact at various levels, including societal, organisational, and individual. Some key drivers that contribute to the national gender pay gap picture include:

- Occupational segregation
- · Lack of representation in leadership
- Work-life balance and caregiving responsibilities
- Education and career choices
- · Bias and discrimination
- Lack of transparency and pay equity practices

It is important to note that these factors interact and reinforce each other, creating a complex web of influences on the gender pay gap. Addressing the gender pay gap requires a comprehensive approach that involves:

- Challenging societal norms and biases
- Implementing equitable policies and practices within organisations
- Promoting inclusive leadership
- Providing support for work-life balance and career development opportunities

#### Why did the gender pay gap decrease this year?

We understand the reduction in the gender pay gap is primarily linked to the increased scope of contracts and payments included in this year's analysis, and adjustments to methodology.

Including the casual and supply workforce in our analysis increases the hourly rate for women, partly because we now include supply teachers who are predominantly women, and partly due to the impact of introducing more LGE men into the lower pay quartile.

In addition, we have reviewed and corrected a methodological discrepancy for the calculation of average pay values for the L&T population for improved robustness of outputs. This drives a higher rate of hourly pay for teachers, where roles are predominantly held by women.

#### Organisation gender pay gap

#### Mean average gender pay gap

- The mean gender pay gap reduced to 2.4% (from 3.2% in 2022).
- This means for every £1 earned by a man, a woman earns 98p.
- Average hourly rate women: £18.62
- Average hourly rate men: £19.07

#### Median average gender pay gap

- The median gender pay gap reduced to 4.3% (from 6.9% in 2022).
- This means for every £1 earned by a man, a woman earns 96p.
- Average hourly rate women: £15.46
- Average hourly rate men: £16.15

#### Bonus gender pay gap

No bonus schemes are in operation at City of Edinburgh Council. Our bonus gender pay gap is therefore 0%.

The mean pay gap between part-time employees and full-time employees is 19.1%; and the median pay gap is 27.5%. This means for every £1 earned by a full-time employee, a part-time employee earns 81p and 72p respectively.

The mean pay gap between full-time women and full-time men is -7.4%; and the median pay gap is -8.3%. This means for every £1 earned by a full-time man, a full-time woman earns £1.07 and £1.08 respectively. We understand this positive pay gap is driven by a greater proportion of full-time women in higher graded LGE roles. Currently 28% of full-time LGE women work in grades one to four, and 72% work in grades five to twelve. When we look at full-time LGE men, 37% work in grades one to four and 63% work in grades five to twelve.

The mean pay gap between part-time women and part-time men is 2.1%; the median pay gap is 8.7%. This means for every £1 earned by a part-time man, a part-time woman earns 98p and 93p respectively.

Analysis of the pay gap between part-time women and full-time men is explored in **Appendix seven**.

For the purposes of analysis employees with weekly contractual hours of 36 hours (LGE and Chief Officer) or 35 hours (L&T) are categorised as full-time. Contracts with lower weekly contractual hours than this and casual contracts are categorised as part-time.

The mean gender pay gap for Local Government Employees (LGEs) continued to narrow this year to 9.2% (from 9.8% in 2022). The mean gender pay gap for the Learning and Teaching (L&T) workforce continued to narrow this year to 1.3% (from 2.0% in 2022).

The mean gender pay gap for Chief Officers increased slightly this year to -0.3% (from -1.3% in 2022) however this still represents a positive pay gap, where women receive on average a higher rate of pay than men working at this level. In recent years we have

focused on driving greater diversity within the Chief Officer group through a more inclusive approach to recruitment.

#### Pay quartile analysis - sex

The workforce profile for sex isn't mirrored across all pay quartiles. In the quartile analysis we see an over-representation of women in the lower quartile (80%). Representation of women observed in the upper middle quartile (63%) is also inconsistent with the workforce profile. This higher concentration of women in the lowest paid quartile and a low representation of men in this quartile is a contributor to the organisation gender pay gap.

Figure 4: Pay quartil	e analysis - sex
Workforce profile:	Female 71%, Male 29%
Lower quartile:	Female 80%, Male 20%
Lower middle quartile:	Female 68%, Male 32%
Upper middle quartile:	Female 63%, Male 37%
Upper quartile:	Female 73%, Male 27%

#### Vertical segregation - sex

The workforce profile for sex isn't mirrored across all salary brackets. Analysis of vertical segregation shows higher concentrations of women in the less than £20K and £40K to £49,999 salary brackets, with significantly fewer women in the uppermost salary bracket. A higher concentration of women in the lower salary brackets and lower representation of men in these salary brackets contributes to the gender pay gap.

Figure 5: Vertical segregation analysis - sex				
Workforce profile:	Female 71%, Male 29%			
Salary range less than £20k:	Female 0%, Male 0%			
Salary range £20K - £29,999:	Female 72.5%, Male 27.5%			
Salary range £30k - £39,999:	Female 65.2%, Male 34.8%			
Salary range £40k - £49,999:	Female 72.7%, Male 27.3%			
Salary range £50k - £59,999:	Female 66.5%, Male 33.5%			
Salary range £60k - £69,999:	Female 69.2%, Male 30.8%			
Salary range £70k - £79,999:	Female 71.8%, Male 28.2%			
Salary range more than £80k:	Female 40.2%, Male 59.8%			

#### **Horizontal segregation - sex**

All roles in the organisation have been aligned to broad occupational groups. An overview of the scope of groups can be found in **Appendix one**. The workforce profile for sex isn't mirrored across all occupations.

Taking consideration of the workforce profile, horizontal segregation analysis helps to explain the reasons for the existing gender pay gap as there is a higher concentration of women in the care, school support and business support occupational groups which tend to be lower paid and part-time roles; in addition, there is under-representation of women working in professional or technical, manager or leadership roles which tend to attract a higher rate of pay.

Figure 6: Horizontal segregation analysis - sex				
Workforce profile:	Female 71%, Male 29%			
Business support group:	Female 77.9%, Male 22.1%			
Care group:	Female 77.2%, Male 22.8%			
Catering, cleaning, FM group:	Female 69.6%, Male 30.4%			
Frontline public services group:	Female 29.4%, Male 70.6%			
Leadership group:	Female 66.6%, Male 33.4%			
Manager group:	Female 64.4%, Male 35.6%			
Professional / Technical group:	Female 57.0%, Male 43.0%			
School support group:	Female 90.9%, Male 9.1%			
Teacher group:	Female 76.8%, Male 23.2%			

# **Appendix five: Ethnicity pay gap report 2023**

#### **Background**

Ethnicity pay gap analysis compares the pay of minority ethnic colleagues with that of white colleagues.

The ethnicity pay gap is driven by a range of interconnected factors that contribute to disparities in earnings among different ethnic groups. Some key drivers that contribute to the national ethnicity pay gap picture include:

- Occupational segregation
- Lack of representation in leadership positions
- Cultural factors and language proficiency
- Educational disparities
- Unequal access to opportunities and networks
- Discrimination and bias

Addressing the ethnicity pay gap, and creating more equitable and inclusive workplaces for individuals of all ethnic backgrounds, requires a multifaceted approach that includes:

- Promoting diversity and inclusion
- Challenging biases and discrimination
- Providing equal access to education and training
- Enhancing transparency in pay practices
- Implementing policies that support the advancement of ethnic minority individuals

#### Why did the ethnicity pay gap increase this year?

In understanding the ethnicity pay gap, it is essential to consider the minority ethnic representation of the organisation workforce profile. The minority ethnic population, excluding white colleagues with an ethnic background, increased from 4% to 5%, and the total colleagues in the group increased from 715 to 996. This trend is linked to increased disclosure across the existing workforce, increased numbers of minority ethnic colleagues joining the organisation, and the increased scope of analysis in 2023.

Whilst the increased representation is a positive trend, a deeper dive of workforce data shows increases in the minority ethnic workforce were concentrated at the lower end of the LGE and L&T pay and grading structures, and 74% of the increased population occupy part-time roles. Our understanding of the observed change to this pay gap relates to greater representation in lower paid roles (and no corresponding increased representation in senior roles) which dilutes the average hourly rate of pay for this workforce group.

#### Organisation ethnicity pay gap

We have reviewed and improved our approach to ethnicity pay gap analysis and reporting for 2023 in response to <u>guidance recently published by the UK Government</u>. Using this approach, we can examine our ethnicity pay gap through different lenses to understand the position for different groups within this dataset. From this year we'll measure:

#### (i) The pay gap between minority ethnic colleagues\* and white colleagues.

\* Where white colleagues with an ethnic background and white non-British colleagues are included in the "white" group.

# (ii) The pay gap between minority ethnic colleagues\*\* and white British colleagues.

\*\* Where white colleagues with an ethnic background and white non-British colleagues are included in the "minority ethnic" group.

In line with this methodology our reporting provides insight into the pay gap, quartile analysis and data on segregation using as per the scope outlined above.

Ethnicity pay gap analysis should be considered in the context of total disclosure (see **Appendix three**) and greater validity of outputs will be achieved as the level of data capture increases.

#### (i) The pay gap between minority ethnic colleagues and white colleagues

#### Mean ethnicity pay gap (excluding white minorities)

- The mean pay gap for the minority ethnic group increased to 16.2% (from 15.2% in 2022).
- This means that for every £1 a white colleague earns, a minority ethnic colleague earns 84p.
- Average hourly rate for minority ethnic employees: £16.06
- Average hourly rate for white employees: £19.16

#### Median ethnicity pay gap (excluding white minorities)

- The median average pay gap for this group increased to 20.4% (from 15.9% in 2022).
- This means that for every £1 a white colleagues earns, a colleaugue from the minority ethnic group earns 80p.
- Average hourly rate for minority ethnic employees: £13.61
- Average hourly rate for white employees: £17.09

No bonus schemes are in operation at City of Edinburgh Council therefore the ethnicity pay gap in respect of bonus is 0%.

The mean ethnicity pay gap for Local Government Employees (LGEs) increased to 9.5% (from 8.9% in 2022). The mean ethnicity pay gap for the Learning and Teaching (L&T) workforce increased to 9.6% (from 8.7% in 2022). We are not able to report the ethnicity pay gap for the Chief Officer group due to limited representation at this level.

Pay gaps can vary significantly among different ethnic groups in the UK and analysis of pay gaps between minority ethnic groups and the white population at the Council follow this trend. The variations observed are influenced by factors such as historical disadvantage, cultural biases, and varying access to opportunities. Disparities in

Policy and Sustainability Committee – 24 October 2023

educational opportunities, attainment levels, and subject choices can impact the career paths and earning potential of individuals from different ethnic groups and backgrounds.

We need to be careful when considering the validity of data outputs for groups with small numbers. As per UK guidance, analysis for groups of fifty employees or less should be aggregated in published pay gap reporting. Ethnicity pay gap data reported in 2022 was published before the new guidance regarding groups of fifty or less was made available. Less than fifty colleagues at the Council are of Caribbean or Black ethnicity so this group has been aggregated into the "other ethnic group" category for reporting purposes. We recognise that studies consistently show that individuals of Caribbean or Black ethnicity face a higher pay gap compared to individuals from other ethnic backgrounds.

#### Figure 7: Mean pay gap by minority ethnic group (excluding white minorities)

Pay gap, Other ethnic group\*: 15.9%

Pay gap, African ethnic group: 17.9%

Pay gap, Asian ethnic group: 19.2%

Pay gap, Mixed or multiple ethnic groups: 3.6%

\*Includes those with Caribbean or Black ethnicity

Mixed or multiple ethnic groups often have a lower pay gap. Further research is required to gain a more comprehensive understanding of the pay gap for mixed or multiple ethnic groups, although this may be linked to higher-than-average levels of educational attainment within this group, allowing individuals to enter fields with better compensation and growth prospects.

#### (ii) The pay gap between minority ethnic colleagues and white British colleagues

#### Mean ethnicity pay gap (including white minorities)

- When including white minority populations with an ethnic background, the mean ethnicity pay gap is lower, at 11.4%.
- This means that for every £1 a white British colleague earns, a minority ethnic colleague earns 89p.
- Average hourly rate for minority ethnic employees: £17.11
- Average hourly rate for white British employees: £19.30

#### Median ethnicity pay gap (including white minorities)

- When including white minority populations with an ethnic background, the median ethnicity pay gap is also lower, at 16.2%.
- This means that for every £1 a white British colleague earns, a minority ethnic colleague earns 84p.
- Average hourly rate for minority ethnic employees: £14.38
- Average hourly rate for white British employees: £17.16

The mean ethnicity pay gap for Local Government Employees (LGEs) is lower (8.2%) than it is for the L&T group (9.7%). We are not able to report the ethnicity pay gap for the Chief Officer group due to a lack of representation at this level.

Policy and Sustainability Committee – 24 October 2023

Again, analysis of pay gaps between minority ethnic groups and the white British population shows that gaps vary by group. In this analysis we see a significantly lower pay gap of 7.5% for the "other ethnic group", when including white colleagues from a minority ethnic background. Pay gaps for other groups vary slightly to the outcomes observed when excluding white minority populations and this is due to a lower disclosure rate in respect of ethnic background.

#### Figure 8: Mean pay gap by minority ethnic group (including white minorities)

Pay gap, Other ethnic group\*: 7.5%
Pay gap, African ethnic group: 18.5%
Pay gap, Asian ethnic group: 19.8%

Pay gap, Mixed or multiple ethnic groups: 4.3%

\*Includes those with Caribbean or Black ethnicity and white minority populations

## Pay quartile analysis - ethnicity

The workforce profile for ethnicity, excluding white minorities, isn't mirrored across all pay quartiles. We see an increased representation of minority ethnic groups in the lower quartile (7%) and lower middle quartile (6%), since last year. There is limited representation of minority ethnic groups in the upper quartile (2%).

#### Figure 9: Pay quartile analysis – ethnicity (excluding white minorities)

Workforce profile: Minority ethnic 5%, white 75%
Lower quartile: Minority ethnic 7%, white 69%
Lower middle quartile: Minority ethnic 6%, white 75%
Upper middle quartile: Minority ethnic 4%, white 74%
Upper quartile: Minority ethnic 2%, white 82%

The workforce profile for ethnicity, including white minorities, also isn't distributed consistently across pay quartiles. We see greater representation of those with minority ethnic backgrounds in the lower quartile, and under-representation in the upper quartile. The lower middle quartile and upper middle quartile are broadly in line with the overall population of 9%.

#### Figure 10: Pay quartile analysis – ethnicity (including white minorities)

Workforce profile: Minority ethnic 9%, white British 67%
Lower quartile: Minority ethnic 12%, white British 59%
Lower middle quartile: Minority ethnic 9%, white British 68%
Upper middle quartile: Minority ethnic 9%, white British 65%
Upper quartile: Minority ethnic 6%, white British 75%

#### Vertical segregation - ethnicity

The organisation's minority ethnic population isn't mirrored proportionately across all salary brackets.

Analysis of vertical segregation, excluding white minorities, shows higher concentrations of minority ethnic colleagues in the £20K to £29,999 salary bracket, with less colleagues in the upper salary brackets, and no colleagues in the greater than £80K bracket.

Figure 11: Vertical segregation analysis - ethnicity (excluding white minorities)				
Workforce profile:	Minority ethnic 5%, white 75%			
Salary range less than £20k:	Minority ethnic 0%, white 0%			
Salary range £20K - £29,999:	Minority ethnic 6.1%, white 72.4%			
Salary range £30k - £39,999:	Minority ethnic 3.9%, white 73.7%			
Salary range £40k - £49,999:	Minority ethnic 2.5%, white 79.2%			
Salary range £50k - £59,999:	Minority ethnic 2.0%, white 83.3%			
Salary range £60k - £69,999:	Minority ethnic 0.8%, white 88.0%			
Salary range £70k - £79,999:	Minority ethnic 3.1%, white 83.2%			
Salary range more than £80k:	Minority ethnic 0%, white 81.7%			

When we include white minority populations in the analysis, we see slightly improved representation in the uppermost salary bandings.

Figure 12: Vertical segregation analysis - ethnicity (including white minorities)				
Workforce profile:	Minority ethnic 9%, white British 67%			
Salary range less than £20k:	Minority ethnic 0%, white British 0%			
Salary range £20K - £29,999:	Minority ethnic 10.5%, white British 63.4%			
Salary range £30k - £39,999:	Minority ethnic 8.6%, white British 65.0%			
Salary range £40k - £49,999:	Minority ethnic 6.5%, white British 71.5%			
Salary range £50k - £59,999:	Minority ethnic 5.9%, white British 76.7%			
Salary range £60k - £69,999:	Minority ethnic 4.2%, white British 82.5%			
Salary range £70k - £79,999:	Minority ethnic 4.6%, white British 80.2%			
Salary range more than £80k:	Minority ethnic 1.2%, white British 80.5%			

#### **Horizontal segregation - ethnicity**

The organisation's minority ethnic population isn't mirrored proportionately across all occupational groups. Analysis of horizontal segregation, excluding white minorities, shows higher concentrations of minority ethnic colleagues in the care, school support, business support, and catering, cleaning, and facilities management occupational groups, which tend to be lower paid and part-time roles. This analysis also demonstrates a lack of representation in leadership and manager roles.

Policy and Sustainability Committee – 24 October 2023 Page 23 of 42

Figure 13:	Horizontal	segregation	analysis -	ethnicity	(excluding	g white minorities)	)

Workforce profile: Minority ethnic 5%, white 75%

Business support group: Minority ethnic 5.2%, white 81.1%

Care group: Minority ethnic 7.5%, white 73.6%

Catering, cleaning, FM group: Minority ethnic 7.1%, white 71.5%

Frontline public services group: Minority ethnic 2.5%, white 72.6%

Leadership group: Minority ethnic 0.9%, white 86.5%

Manager group: Minority ethnic 3.1%, white 84.4%

Professional / Technical group: Minority ethnic 4.3%, white 80.4%

School support group: Minority ethnic 6.9%, white 71.5%

Teacher group: Minority ethnic 3.0%, white 78.3%

When we include white minority populations in the analysis, we see slightly improved representation in the leadership group.

Figure 14:	Horizontal seg	aregation ana	ılvsis - ethr	icitv (incl	udina whit	e minorities)
J		,		- 7		

Workforce profile: Minority ethnic 9%, white British 67%

Business support group: Minority ethnic 7.8%, white British 75.3%

Care group: Minority ethnic 9.2%, white British 67.7%

Catering, cleaning, FM group: Minority ethnic 11.8%, white British 63.3%

Frontline public services group: Minority ethnic 5.4%, white British 64.8%

Leadership group: Minority ethnic 3.4%, white British 82.4%

Manager group: Minority ethnic 7.4%, white British 76.7%

Professional / Technical group: Minority ethnic 8.8%, white British 72.1%

School support group: Minority ethnic 12.4%, white British 61.2%

Teacher group: Minority ethnic 8.1%, white British 68.6%

# Appendix six: Disability pay gap report 2023

#### **Background**

The disability pay gap compares the pay gap between employees who identify as having a disability or long-term health condition, and those employees who do not.

Despite legal protections and efforts to promote more inclusive employment practices, disabled individuals continue to face significant disparities in pay and employment opportunities across the UK. Several factors contribute to the disability pay gap picture across the UK, including:

- Occupational segregation
- Limited employment opportunities
- Education and skills development
- Workplace discrimination
- Work limitations and productivity perceptions
- Underemployment and part-time work
- Social and systemic factors

Addressing the disability pay gap requires a comprehensive approach that encompasses:

- Equal employment opportunities
- Anti-discrimination policies
- Accessible workplaces
- Reasonable accommodations
- Inclusive hiring practices
- Targeted support for education and skills development

By promoting inclusivity and eliminating barriers, we can work towards reducing the disability pay gap and ensure fair compensation for individuals with disabilities.

Using the Government Statistical Service (GSS) harmonised definition of disability, 19% of people of working age were disabled in 2020. Women were more likely to be disabled than men, at 24% and 19%, respectively (Family Resources Survey). Three percent of our workforce identify as having a disability or long-term health condition. It should be recognised that some colleagues may not identify as being disabled, even if they fall within the legal definition of this.

#### Why did the disability pay gap increase this year?

In understanding the disability pay gap, it is essential to consider the representation of declared disabled colleagues in the organisation workforce profile. The declared disabled population, increased by 128 colleagues, and the total colleagues in the group increased from 517 to 645. This trend is linked to increased disclosure across the existing workforce, increased numbers of declared disabled colleagues joining the organisation, and the increased scope of analysis in 2023.

Whilst the increased representation is a positive trend, a deeper dive of workforce data shows increases in the declared disabled workforce were concentrated at the lower end of the LGE and L&T pay and grading structures and 70% of the increased population occupy part-time roles. Our understanding of the observed change to this pay gap relates to greater representation in lower paid roles (and no corresponding increased representation in senior roles) which dilutes the average hourly rate of pay for this workforce group.

#### Organisation disability pay gap

### Mean disability pay gap

- The mean average pay gap for declared disabled employees increased to 8.7% (from 5.0% in 2022).
- This means that for every £1 earned by an employee who is not disabled, a declared disabled employee earns 91p.
- Average hourly rate for declared disabled employees: £17.35
- Average hourly rate for employees who are not disabled: £19.01

#### Median disability pay gap

- The median average pay gap for declared disabled employees increased to 7.6% (from 5.0% in 2022).
- This means that for every £1 earned by an employee who is not disabled, a declared disabled employee earns 92p.
- Average hourly rate for declared disabled employees: £15.36
- Average hourly rate for employees who are not disabled: £16.62

No bonus schemes are in operation at City of Edinburgh Council therefore the disability pay gap in respect of bonus is 0%.

The mean disability pay gap sits at -0.6% for LGEs and 7.4% for learning and teaching. This means there's a positive pay gap bias in favour of disabled colleagues for the LGE workforce. A deep dive of the data shows the majority of declared disabled colleagues work in LGE roles (83%). In the LGE workforce, declared disabled colleagues have an average hourly rate of £15.73 and this is £15.65 for colleagues who are not disabled. In the L&T workforce, declared disabled colleagues have an average hourly rate of £25.49 and this is £27.63 for colleagues who are not disabled.

Pay gap analysis for the Chief Official population is not possible due to a lack of representation at this level of the organisation.

A breakdown of pay gap by nature of disability shows that this varies between groups, with a wider gap observed for those identifying as disabled and "limited a little".

#### Mean disability pay gap "limited a little"

- Mean disability pay gap "limited a little": 13.5%
- This means that for every £1 earned by an employee who is not disabled, a
  declared disabled employee who is "limited a little" earns 86p.
- Average hourly rate for declared disabled "limited a little": £16.45
- Average hourly rate for employees who are not disabled £19.01

A smaller gap exists for the disabled and "limited a lot" group.

#### Mean disability pay gap "limited a lot"

- Mean disability pay gap "limited a lot": 4.9%
- This means that for every £1 earned by an employee who is not disabled, a declared disabled employee who is "limited a little" earns 95p.
- Average hourly rate for declared disabled "limited a lot": £18.08
- Average hourly rate for employees who are not disabled: £19.01

#### Pay quartile analysis - disability

The proportion of disabled colleagues across the pay quartiles broadly mirrors the workforce profile however as is the case with other protected groups, representation is lacking in the upper quartile, which contributes to the disability pay gap.

#### Figure 15: Pay quartile analysis - disability

Workforce profile: Declared disabled 3%, not disabled 75%
Lower quartile: Declared disabled 3%, not disabled 72%
Lower middle quartile: Declared disabled 3%, not disabled 75%
Upper middle quartile: Declared disabled 3%, not disabled 71%
Upper quartile: Declared disabled 2%, not disabled 80%

#### Vertical segregation – disability

The organisation's declared disabled population isn't mirrored proportionately across all salary brackets. Analysis of vertical segregation shows higher concentrations of disabled colleagues in the £30K to £39,999 and £20K to £29,999 salary brackets, with less representation in the upper salary brackets, and no representation in the upper salary brackets.

Figure 16: Vertical segregation analysis - disability			
Workforce profile:	Declared disabled 3%, not disabled 75%		
Salary range less than £20k:	Declared disabled 0%, not disabled 0%		
Salary range £20K - £29,999:	Declared disabled 3.2%, not disabled 73.6%		
Salary range £30k - £39,999:	Declared disabled 3.1%, not disabled 71.0%		
Salary range £40k - £49,999:	Declared disabled 2.7%, not disabled 77.0%		
Salary range £50k - £59,999:	Declared disabled 2.1%, not disabled 80.4%		
Salary range £60k - £69,999:	Declared disabled 1.6%, not disabled 83.3%		
Salary range £70k - £79,999:	Declared disabled 0%, not disabled 84.7%		
Salary range more than £80k:	Declared disabled 0%, not disabled 79.3%		

# Horizontal segregation - disability

The organisation's declared disabled population isn't mirrored proportionately across all occupational groups. Analysis of horizontal segregation shows much higher concentrations of disabled colleagues in the business support and professional/technical occupational groups however there is limited representation in the leadership group.

Figure 17: Horizontal segregation analysis - disability				
Workforce profile:	Declared disabled 3%, not disabled 75%			
Business support group:	Declared disabled 6.9%, not disabled 76.3%			
Care group:	Declared disabled 3.1%, not disabled 76.4%			
Catering, cleaning, FM group:	Declared disabled 2.2%, not disabled 75.6%			
Frontline public services group:	Declared disabled 3.1%, not disabled 70.4%			
Leadership group:	Declared disabled 1.4%, not disabled 82.2%			
Manager group:	Declared disabled 3.5%, not disabled 81.2%			
Professional / Technical group:	Declared disabled 5.0%, not disabled 78.7%			
School support group:	Declared disabled 2.8%, not disabled 74.0%			
Teacher group:	Declared disabled 1.9%, not disabled 76.3%			

# Appendix seven: Intersectionality pay gap analysis

In line with our commitment to provide more detailed pay gap analysis in respect of intersectionality, this section of the report is new for 2023. For simplicity the analysis contained in this section of the report concentrates on mean average pay gaps.

Pay gap intersectionality refers to the overlapping effects and compounded disadvantages experienced by individuals who belong to multiple marginalised groups, resulting in even greater disparities in pay and earnings. It recognises that individuals face unique challenges and discrimination based on the intersection of their gender, race, ethnicity, disability, and other social identities. Some key aspects of pay gap intersectionality include:

- Amplified disadvantages
- Unique experiences and barriers
- Invisibility and underrepresentation
- Multiple layers of discrimination

Addressing pay gap intersectionality requires comprehensive solutions that acknowledge and address the unique challenges faced by individuals with intersecting marginalised identities. This involves implementing policies and practices that promote diversity, equity, and inclusion, providing targeted support and resources, and challenging biases and discrimination across all intersecting dimensions.

This suite of reporting forms the foundation for intersectionality analysis at the City of Edinburgh Council. We will build on this for the 2024 report.

We recognise that some pay gaps are larger than we'd like, and we've undertaken a range of scenario modelling to understand what it would take to close these gaps. Insight from this report was used to establish an evidence base in developing our updated EDI action plan, which should be read in conjunction with this pay gap report.

The report provides analysis where the total level of employee disclosure for a protected characteristic is above, or close to, 80%. Therefore, the reporting does not incorporate analysis on religion or belief, sexual orientation, gender reassignment, marital and civil partnership at present, and it does not currently provide analysis for pregnancy and maternity. As data capture improves, we intend to expand this suite of reporting.

As per national guidance for ethnicity pay gap reporting we have not included analysis for groups of less than fifty. We are therefore unable to provide analysis of the experience of minority ethnic declared disabled women in this report due to limited numbers.

Data on average rates of pay used in the intersectionality analysis is available in **Appendix eight**.

# 1. Intersectionality and gender (sex)

#### 1.1 Women working on a part-time basis

This analysis compares the difference in pay between women working part-time hours and men working full-time hours.

At the Council 52% of colleagues work part-time hours and 48% work full-time hours. Of those working part time, 82% are women and 18% are men.

The mean gender pay gap for women working part-time hours reduced to 15.9% (from 19.7% in 2022).

Several factors contribute to lower earnings for part-time women compared to men working full-time. Part-time roles are move prevalent in care and education settings which generally offer lower compensation compared to full-time roles in other services.

Occupational segregation limits women's access to higher-paying opportunities.

Part-time work can impact career advancement opportunities and women who choose to work part-time due to caregiving responsibilities, family commitments, and other personal reasons may experience slower career progression, fewer opportunities for progression, and limited access to higher-paid leadership positions.

When looking at grade by grade pay gaps for package pay, women tend to take home less package pay resulting from Working Time Payments as these payments are pro-rated for part-time roles (predominantly worked by women). This disparity in earnings is visible when we drill-down into the pay gaps for package pay by grade for LGEs, where the pay gap for Grade 3 women is 4.6% and the pay gap for Grade 5 women is 5.9%. When we analyse the pay gaps for basic pay only, the gap for Grade 3 is 0.1% and the gap for Grade 5 is 2.8%.

#### 1.2 Women over forty years and under forty years

This analysis compares the difference in pay between:

- 1. Females over forty years with males over forty years
- 2. Females under forty years with males under forty years

The current workforce profile by sex and age is as follows:

- 36% of women are under forty years
- 64% of women are over forty years
- 34% of men are under forty years
- 66% of men are over forty years
- The mean gender pay gap for women over forty years of age continued to narrow to 4.3% (from 5.3% in 2022).
- There is a positive mean average pay gap for women under forty years of age. The pay gap for this group is -1.7% (from -1.7% in 2022).

This aspect of the gender pay gap highlights the unique challenges and factors that contribute to lower earnings for older women. Many older women have experienced career interruptions or reduced work hours due to caregiving responsibilities for children, aging parents, or family members with disabilities. These interruptions can result in fewer years of continuous work and limited opportunities for career advancement, leading to overall lower earnings.

Older women often face occupational segregation, with a higher representation in lower paying sectors and industries. Additionally, they may encounter barriers to promotion and career progression, such as biases, stereotypes, and limited access to leadership roles. This perpetuates the pay gap as women progress in their careers. Historically there has also been a perception that senior roles cannot be undertaken on a part-time or flexible basis and we have taken positive actions in this space to change this mindset.

# 2. Intersectionality and Ethnicity

#### 2.1 Minority ethnic women

This insight reflects the intersection of gender and ethnicity, highlighting the specific challenges and factors that contribute to lower earnings for minority ethnic women, including:

- Occupational segregation
- Discrimination and bias in the workplace that undervalues their skills, qualifications, and contributions
- Underrepresentation in leadership roles and positions of influence
- Educational disparities, limited access to quality education, cultural biases and socioeconomic factors can impact their educational attainment and opportunities for skill development and higher earnings
- Language proficiency and cultural barriers

This analysis compares the difference in pay between:

- 1. Minority ethnic women (excluding white minorities) and white men.
- 2. Minority ethnic women (including white minorities) and white British men.
- The mean gender pay gap between minority ethnic women (excluding white minorities) and white men is 18.9%.
- The mean gender pay gap between minority ethnic women (including white minorities) and white British men is 14.4%.

This analysis highlights a disparity in earnings for minority ethnic women working at the organisation. The pay gap experienced by minority ethnic women in the organisation of 18.9% (and 14.4%) is significantly wider than that experienced by women in general, where the pay gap is 2.5%. The mean pay gap between white women and white men is 2.9%.

For comparison, the mean pay gap between minority ethnic men and white men is lower than that for minority ethnic women, at 14.7%. The mean pay gap between minority ethnic men and white British men is also lower, at 8.4%.

Analysis of pay gaps between different groups of minority ethnic women and white men shows that gaps vary by group (**see Figure 18**) with a much wider gap of 22.7% for women in the Asian ethnic group compared with 5.5% for women from mixed or multiple ethnic groups .

Again, analysis of mean pay gaps between different groups of minority ethnic women and white British men shows that gaps vary by group however there is a prounounced difference when white women from minority backgrounds are included in the "other ethnic group" category (see **Figure 19**).

# Figure 18: Mean pay gap for minority ethnic women, by minority ethnic group (excluding white minorities)

Pay gap, Other ethnic group\*: 17.8%
Pay gap, African ethnic group: 18.6%
Pay gap, Asian ethnic group: 22.7%

Pay gap, Mixed or multiple ethnic groups: 5.5%

# Figure 19: Mean pay gap for minority ethnic women, by minority ethnic group (including white minorities)

Pay gap, Other ethnic group\*\*: 10.8%
Pay gap, African ethnic group: 19.0%
Pay gap, Asian ethnic group: 23.0%
Pay gap, Mixed or multiple ethnic groups: 5.9%

#### 2.1 Part-time minority ethnic women

This analysis compares the difference in pay between:

- 1. Part-time minority ethnic women (excluding white minorities) and full-time white men.
- 2. Part-time minority ethnic women (including white minorities) and full-time white British men.
- The mean gender pay gap between part-time minority ethnic women (excluding white minorities) and full-time white men is 29.3%.
- The mean gender pay gap between part-time minority ethnic women (including white minorities) and full-time white British men is marginally lower at 26.8%.

The pay gap experienced by part-time minority ethnic women of 29.3% (and 26.8%) is almost double that of part-time women in general, where the observed pay gap is 15.9%.

For comparison, the mean pay gap between part-time minority ethnic and full-time white men is comparable to that of part-time minority ethnic women, at 32.2%. The pay gap between part-time minority ethnic men and full-time white British men is lower, at 23.7%.

#### 2.2 Minority ethnic women over forty years and under forty years

This analysis compares the difference in pay between:

1. Minority ethnic women over forty years (excluding white minorities) and white men over forty years

Policy and Sustainability Committee – 24 October 2023 Page 33 of 42

<sup>\*</sup>Excludes white minority populations, includes those with Caribbean or Black ethnicity

<sup>\*\*</sup>Includes white minority populations, includes those with Caribbean or Black ethnicity

- 2. Minority ethnic women under forty years (excluding white minorities) with white men under forty years
- The mean pay gap for minority ethnic women over forty years is 20.2%.
- The mean pay gap for minority ethnic women under forty years of age is lower at 16.1%.

This analysis demonstrates that the pay gap experienced by minority ethnic women in the over forty years age bracket (20.2%) is significantly higher than that of women in the over forty years age bracket in general, where the pay gap is 4.3%.

### 3. Intersectionality and Disability

#### 3.1 Declared disabled women

This analysis compares the difference in pay between declared disabled females and that of men who don't identify as having a disability or long-term health condition.

- The mean pay gap for declared disabled women is 10.4%
- The mean pay gap for declared disabled women who are "limited a little" is 15.2%.
- The mean pay gap for declared disabled women who are "limited a lot" is 6.2%.

This analysis highlights a disparity in earnings for declared disabled women working at the organisation. The pay gap experienced by declared disabled women in the organisation of 10.4% is four times wider than that experienced by women in general, where the pay gap is 2.4%.

For comparison, we've analysed the pay gap between men who are not disabled and declared disabled men, and the resulting pay gaps are slightly higher than those observed for women. The mean pay gap for declared disabled men is 13.0%; 17.2% for declared disabled men who are limited a little; and 10.1% for declared disabled men who are limited a lot.

#### 3.2 Part-time declared disabled women

This analysis compares the difference in pay between part-time women with a declared disability and full-time men who are not disabled. Currently 51% of disabled colleagues work on a part-time basis and 49% are full-time. The declared disabled part-time workforce is 78% female and 22% male.

The mean pay gap for part-time declared disabled women is 23.7%.

The pay gap experienced by part-time declared disabled women of 23.7% is wider than that of part-time women in general, where the observed pay gap is 15.9%, and it is slightly smaller than the pay gap experienced by part-time minority ethnic women.

For comparison, the pay gap for part-time declared disabled men is slightly higher at 26.4%.

#### 3.3. Declared disabled women over forty years and under forty years

This analysis compares the difference in pay between:

- Declared disabled women over forty years and men over forty years who are not disabled
- 2. Declared disabled women under forty years and men under forty years who are not disabled
- The mean pay gap for declared disabled women over forty years of age is 12.0%.
- The mean pay gap for declared disabled women under forty years of age is 6.6%.

This analysis demonstrates that the pay gap experienced by declared disabled women in the over forty years age bracket (12.0%) is more than double that of women in the over forty years age bracket in general, where the pay gap is 4.3%, and it is significantly lower than the gap experienced by minority ethnic women who are over 40 years (20.2%).

# Appendix eight: Intersectionality analysis – average hourly pay data

## 1. Intersectionality and gender (sex)

#### 1.1 Women working on a part-time basis

- Average hourly rate for part-time women: £16.80
- Average hourly rate for full-time men: £19.97

## 1.2 Women over forty years and under forty years

- Average hourly rate for women over forty years: £18.68
- Average hourly rate for men over forty years: £19.53
- Average hourly rate for women under forty years: £18.52
- Average hourly rate for men under forty years: £18.21

## 2. Intersectionality and Ethnicity

#### 2.1 Minority ethnic women

- Average hourly rate for minority ethnic women (excluding white minorities): £15.86
- Average hourly rate for white men: £19.56
- Average hourly rate for minority ethnic women (including white minorities): £16.82
- Average hourly rate for white British men: £19.65

#### 2.1 Part-time minority ethnic women

- Average hourly rate for part-time minority ethnic women (excluding white minorities): £14.39
- Average hourly rate for full-time white men: £20.35
- Average hourly rate for part-time minority ethnic women (including white minorities): £14.94
- Average hourly rate for full-time white British men: £20.41

#### 2.2 Minority ethnic women over forty years and under forty years

- Average hourly rate for minority ethnic women over forty years: £15.91
- Average hourly rate for white men over forty years: £19.93
- Average hourly rate for minority ethnic women under forty years: £15.75
- Average hourly rate for white men under forty years: £18.78

# 3. Intersectionality and Disability

#### 3.1 Declared disabled women

- Average hourly rate for declared disabled women: £17.51
- Average hourly rate for men who are not disabled: £19.54

#### 3.2 Part-time declared disabled women

- Average hourly rate for part-time declared disabled women: £15.53
- Average hourly rate for full-time men who are not disabled: £20.35

#### 3.3. Declared disabled women over forty years and under forty years

- Average hourly rate for declared disabled women over forty years: £17.56
- Average hourly rate for men over forty years who are not disabled: £19.95
- Average hourly rate for declared disabled women under forty years: £17.44
- Average hourly rate for men under forty years who are not disabled: £18.68

# Appendix nine: Benchmarking data

Guidance issued by the UK government specifies that pay gap analysis for statutory purposes should examine gaps for package pay.

There are currently varying interpretations of Regulation 7 of the Equality Act 2010 (Specific Duties) (Scotland) Regulations 2012. In the absence of detailed guidance, Scottish Councils approach their gender pay gap analysis differently at present (with some reporting base pay only and others reporting package pay). Therefore, we are not currently able to compare our pay gap data with that of other local authorities.

The current Local Government Benchmarking Framework (LGBF) survey looks at pay gaps for base pay. The scope of this survey does not look at the pay gap for package pay.

We have engaged with Scottish Councils and other relevant stakeholders through the SPDS Equalities sub-group to develop a standardised and consistent approach for gender pay gap reporting for the 32 local authorities in Scotland. A formal proposal will be submitted to the SPDS Executive group for consideration later in 2023. If approved, this approach would be adopted in time for the 2025 reporting cycle and would enable robust comparison of pay gap data across Scottish Councils.

We've benchmarked our pay gap analysis in relation to wider national statistics. As we improve data completeness for disability and ethnicity, we'll be able to achieve greater validity of these pay gap outputs.

It should be noted that limited data exists in the wider domain around ethnicity, disability and in particular, intersectionality pay gaps.

- The organisation's mean gender pay gap of 2.4% is much lower than the Scottish national pay gap of 10.1% (Close the Gap) and the UK pay gap of 14.9% (Office of National Statistics)
- The organisation's mean ethnicity pay gap of 16.2% is higher than the Scottish national pay gap of 10.3% (Office of National Statistics)
- The organisation's mean disability pay gap of 8.7% is much lower than the Scottish national pay gap of 16.2% (Scottish Government) and the UK pay gap of 17.2% (Trades Union Congress)
- The organisation's mean pay gap for part-time women of 15.9% is much lower than the Scottish national pay gap of 27% (Close the Gap)
- The organisation's pay gap of 10.4% between declared disabled women and men who are not disabled is much lower than the Scottish national pay gap of 22% (Close the Gap)

# Appendix ten: What are we doing to close the pay gaps?

This section provides a broad overview of strategy and key priorities to support the reduction of gender, ethnicity and disability pay gaps at our organisation, over the longer term. Our strategy aligns to the key themes of developing our understanding, creating an inclusive culture, and attracting and retaining a diverse workforce.

A full report on EDI related activity over the past twelve months is also being reported to this committee, where more detail is available. We intend to publish our new EDI strategy and action plan in October 2024 following publication of our new People Strategy.

Robust data provides an evidence base on which to prioritise interventions and resources, identify gaps in performance, drive measurable improvements. Quantitative and qualitative data also allows us to measure the success of our interventions.

We continue to work closely with external organisations and other Scottish Councils in relation to strategy, best practice, and opportunities to reduce our pay gaps, and to ensure that our organisation creates a diverse, fair, and inclusive workplace.

We are working together with other Scottish Councils through the SPDS Equalities subgroup to develop a consistent approach to pay gap analysis across Scotland that will allow us to establish a true understanding of our pay gap position, relative to others. A proposal will be submitted to the SPDS Executive group later this year with a view to adopting this standardised approach from March 2025.

Currently, there is no requirement for organisations to report their ethnicity and disability pay gaps. We aim to better understand our position for ethnicity, disability and intersectionality pay gaps as more data becomes available in the public domain.

We will continue to undertake initiatives to improve our level of data capture in respect of employee protected characteristics, encouraging colleagues to identify rather than record "prefer not to say", and working towards improved disclosure over the longer term to increase the validity of pay gap analysis. We aim to expand our pay gap reporting for additional protected characteristics as disclosure for these groups improves.

In the context of protected characteristics, we aim to develop our understanding further by embedding data processes to allow accurate analysis of, and identify potential trends and constraints connected to, for example flexible working requests, promotion, retention patterns for women following maternity leave and reasons for termination of employment.

During the last twelve months we have modelled a range of different scenarios and pay gap projections in relation to changes to our workforce profile to develop our understanding.

#### We recognise that:

- In general, our workforce profile is not adequately reflected at senior levels of the organisation.
- Women, minority ethnic colleagues, and disabled colleagues, are often concentrated in part-time roles; and part-time working tends to be concentrated in lower paid roles.

 There is a lack of availability of part-time working opportunities at more senior levels of the organisation.

The lack of part-time roles in the leadership and management space poses a challenge in creating opportunities to attract and retain a diverse workforce, and in changing the picture of occupational segregation at the organisation.

Longer-term, we want to focus on implementing strategic actions to improve our position in respect of:

- Representation in leadership roles and positions of influence
- Availability of part-time roles at the senior level

Over the longer term we aim to have representation at the senior level that reflects our workforce profile.

#### Key to this will be:

- Exploring the potential to introduce more part-time and flexible working opportunities at management and leadership levels of the organisation.
- Engaging with under-represented groups to understand barriers and improve our recruitment approach and attraction.
- Further learning and guidance on positive action measures for recruiting managers.
- Developing a structured approach to career progression and succession planning in the context of equalities, diversity, and inclusion.

# Appendix eleven: Pay gap trends 2018 to 2023

#### Mean gender pay gap

2023 2.4%

2022 3.2%

2021 3.8%

2020 4.1%

2019 4.7%

2018 4.8%

## Mean ethnicity pay gap

2023 16.2% excluding white minorities, 11.4% including white minorities

2022 15.2% excluding white minorities

2021 14.1% excluding white minorities

#### Mean disability pay gap

2023 8.7%

2022 5.0%

2021 7.0%